

Digital Payments, Behaviors and Predictive Analysis

Youssef Camara

Under the supervision of David Bounie

Doctoriales i^3 - May 27 2020 (ZOOM)



Background

- ▶ The study of the macroeconomy has long been limited by the frequency, accuracy and coverage of official data
- ▶ In recent years, however, many new data sources have become available through the electronic recording of economic transactions
- ▶ These new data sources have the potential to contribute to long-standing problems such as the time lag in economic monitoring
- ▶ As well, it has become possible to study new questions which cannot be addressed with monthly official data:
 - ▶ Weekly, daily or intra-day patterns of online and offline consumption
 - ▶ Very short-term and localized consumption responses to events

Background

The present thesis is concerned with such new research directions. It intends to use and promote card payment data in a perspective:

- 1 To better predict economic activity over time and at different levels of aggregation (geographical and sectoral)
- 2 To measure the impact of online payments (and new payment technology) on household consumption expenditure
- 3 To investigate the causal impact of anticipated or unanticipated events on economic activity

Outline

- 1 Motivation
- 2 Paper 1: New payment Technology Adoption
- 3 Paper 2: Online Commerce and Gravity Model
- 4 Paper 3: Consumer Spending Response to COVID-19
- 5 Future Research

Paper 1: Card-Sales Response to Merchant Contactless Payment Acceptance

Motivation and Research Questions

- ▶ Disruptive innovations in digital payments are happening in a large number of countries around the world, especially in Asia and Europe
- ▶ Starting from 2012, the French major banks have decided to massively issue cards with contactless technology

Paper 1: Card-Sales Response to Merchant Contactless Payment Acceptance

Motivation and Research Questions

- ▶ Disruptive innovations in digital payments are happening in a large number of countries around the world, especially in Asia and Europe
- ▶ Starting from 2012, the French major banks have decided to massively issue cards with contactless technology
- ▶ What is the impact of this new technology on merchant card sales?
 - ▶ Do accepting a new payment technology allow merchants increasing their business sales?
 - ▶ Is the impact the same according to sectors (e.g. restaurants, hotels), and the size of business (small versus large merchants)?
 - ▶ What is the effect on the use of other accepted payment methods (spillover effects)?

Card-Sales Response to Contactless Payment

Main Findings

Using score matching and difference-in-difference setting:

- ▶ Our results suggest that the introduction of contactless payments promotes business growth, especially the small merchants, new entrepreneurs and businesses that make small amount per purchase, such as bakeries, restaurants
- ▶ The acceptance of contactless payments has positive spillover effects on old payment methods and is a tool to attract more consumers

Card-Sales Response to Contactless Payment

Main Findings

Using score matching and difference-in-difference setting:

- ▶ Our results suggest that the introduction of contactless payments promotes business growth, especially the small merchants, new entrepreneurs and businesses that make small amount per purchase, such as bakeries, restaurants
- ▶ The acceptance of contactless payments has positive spillover effects on old payment methods and is a tool to attract more consumers

Contributions

- ▶ First paper that investigates the causal impact of new payment technology on merchant sales
- ▶ One of the first contributions to the literature on the effects of financial technologies (Fintech) on the real economy

Paper 2: Online Commerce, Inter-Regional Retail Trade, and the Evolution of Gravity Effects

Motivation and Research Questions

- ▶ Retail e-commerce is growing quickly and now represents a significant proportion of household final consumption expenditure (21% in Fr)
- ▶ Little is known about the ways in which consumer mobility and economic relations between region have been modified by e-commerce

Paper 2: Online Commerce, Inter-Regional Retail Trade, and the Evolution of Gravity Effects

Motivation and Research Questions

- ▶ Retail e-commerce is growing quickly and now represents a significant proportion of household final consumption expenditure (21% in Fr)
- ▶ Little is known about the ways in which consumer mobility and economic relations between region have been modified by e-commerce
- ▶ Does the geographical location still continue to play a key role?
- ▶ How are the inter-regional retail trade linkages and the changes in the gravity effects between regions altered by online commerce, as opposed to traditional point-of-sale (off-line) commerce ?
- ▶ Is the gravity model still valid ?

Online Commerce and Evolution of Gravity Effects

Main Results

- ▶ We build original inter-regional retail trade measures from 20 billion consumer online and in-store transactions made through bank cards
- ▶ We find that gravity relationships have been changed by the availability of e-commerce; distance is a less strong predictor of online trade
- ▶ The increasing movement toward online purchasing may tend to increase the concentration of economic activity, and may have important implications for regional economic development

Online Commerce and Evolution of Gravity Effects

Main Results

- ▶ We build original inter-regional retail trade measures from 20 billion consumer online and in-store transactions made through bank cards
- ▶ We find that gravity relationships have been changed by the availability of e-commerce; distance is a less strong predictor of online trade
- ▶ The increasing movement toward online purchasing may tend to increase the concentration of economic activity, and may have important implications for regional economic development

Online Commerce and Evolution of Gravity Effects

Main Results

- ▶ We build original inter-regional retail trade measures from 20 billion consumer online and in-store transactions made through bank cards
- ▶ We find that gravity relationships have been changed by the availability of e-commerce; distance is a less strong predictor of online trade
- ▶ The increasing movement toward online purchasing may tend to increase the concentration of economic activity, and may have important implications for regional economic development

Contributions

- ▶ One of first papers that investigate the impact of online commerce on inter-regional retail trade
- ▶ Contribution to the literature that analyses 1) the ways in which geographic frictions reduce inter-regional trade, 2) geographic patterns of trade between individuals using online transactions, and 3) the local structure of consumption industries

P3: Consumers' Mobility, Expenditure and Online-Offline Substitution Response to COVID-19

Context and Research Questions

- ▶ Since the end of 2019, from Asia to Africa via Europe, the whole world has been going through an unprecedented crisis named COVID-19
- ▶ To halt the spread of infection, major policy measures have been put in place, and have led to a sharp decline in output in many economies
- ▶ Faced with a significant shock, economic agents must adapt: the nature, degree of that adaptation may limit the impact of the shock

P3: Consumers' Mobility, Expenditure and Online-Offline Substitution Response to COVID-19

Context and Research Questions

- ▶ Since the end of 2019, from Asia to Africa via Europe, the whole world has been going through an unprecedented crisis named COVID-19
- ▶ To halt the spread of infection, major policy measures have been put in place, and have led to a sharp decline in output in many economies
- ▶ Faced with a significant shock, economic agents must adapt: the nature, degree of that adaptation may limit the impact of the shock
- ▶ How has mandatory containment reduced consumer mobility?
- ▶ What is the impact of the containment due to the COVID-19 epidemic on the French consumer spending (hourly, daily and weekly)?
 - ▶ Is the impact the same according to sectors (essentials vs non essentials), the size of cities (Paris vs other cities), and the channel (offline vs online)?

French Consumers Response to COVID-19

Some Results

- ▶ On average, a CB travelled 1/4 of the distance during the containment
- ▶ A significant drop in activity of about 60% during containment. The overall decline is greater at the end of the day and week

French Consumers Response to COVID-19

Some Results

- ▶ On average, a CB travelled 1/4 of the distance during the containment
- ▶ A significant drop in activity of about 60% during containment. The overall decline is greater at the end of the day and week
- ▶ Online activity is much less affected by the restrictions on physical movement of consumers. It is twice as great as the declines (-30%)
- ▶ The impact of the containment differed across types of business. Essential activity is unsurprisingly and naturally less affected
- ▶ The online shopping option diminished somewhat the overall impact of the shock on consumption, thereby increasing resiliency of economy

French Consumers Response to COVID-19

Some Results

- ▶ On average, a CB travelled 1/4 of the distance during the containment
- ▶ A significant drop in activity of about 60% during containment. The overall decline is greater at the end of the day and week
- ▶ Online activity is much less affected by the restrictions on physical movement of consumers. It is twice as great as the declines (-30%)
- ▶ The impact of the containment differed across types of business. Essential activity is unsurprisingly and naturally less affected
- ▶ The online shopping option diminished somewhat the overall impact of the shock on consumption, thereby increasing resiliency of economy
- ▶ The decline in the value of transactions during the containment is substantially greater in Paris than elsewhere

Conclusion and Future Research

Many interesting directions for future research

- ▶ COVID-19

- ▶ Examining the emergence of the economy from the period of disruption, and the dynamic path of consumption recovery by sector
- ▶ At consumer level: Investigating the heterogeneity of consumption shocks in the population
- ▶ At firm level: Identifying income shocks and predicting fragility risks
- ▶ Nowcasting: improving models for predicting health outcomes

Conclusion and Future Research

Many interesting directions for future research

- ▶ COVID-19
 - ▶ Examining the emergence of the economy from the period of disruption, and the dynamic path of consumption recovery by sector
 - ▶ At consumer level: Investigating the heterogeneity of consumption shocks in the population
 - ▶ At firm level: Identifying income shocks and predicting fragility risks
 - ▶ Nowcasting: improving models for predicting health outcomes
- ▶ (Un)Anticipated shocks
 - ▶ Climate Change, Extreme Weather Events and Consumer Behaviour: Evidence from the European Heatwave
- ▶ Nowcasting model for economic activity (e.g. GDP) at geographical and sectoral levels

Thank you for your attention !

References

- ▶ Bounie, D. Camara, Y. (2019), Card-sales response to merchant contactless payment acceptance: Causal evidence, SSRN
- ▶ Bounie, D., Camara, Y. Galbraith, J. W (2020), Consumers' Mobility, Expenditure and Online-Offline Substitution Response to COVID-19: Evidence from French Transaction Data, Technical report, SSRN
- ▶ Agarwal, S., Qian, W., Yeung, B. Y., and Zou, X. (2019). Mobile Wallet and Entrepreneurial Growth. AEA Papers and Proceedings
- ▶ Agarwal, S., Jensen, J. Monte, F. (2019), The geography of consumption, Technical report, NBER, working paper 236
- ▶ Anderson, J. E. van Wincoop, E. (2003), 'Gravity with Gravitas: A Solution to the Border Puzzle', American Economic Review 93 (1)
- ▶ Galbraith, J. W. Tkacz, G. (2018), 'Nowcasting with payments system data', International Journal of Forecasting 34 (2), 366–376